

MOT Consultation
3rd Floor, Zone 19
Great Minster House
33 Horseferry Road
London SW1P 4DR

14 March 2023

Dear Sir / Madam

I write on behalf of the CO Research Trust in response to the Department for Transport's "Changes to the date of the first MOT test and research into other MOT enhancements" consultation which closes on 22 March 2023.

The CO Research Trust is a registered charity, established in 2005. The objective of the charity is to reduce the incidents of death and serious injury from carbon monoxide (CO) exposure. We do this by funding evidence-based research relating to CO exposure, the outcomes of which we make freely available to policymakers, campaigning organisations, and those seeking to raise awareness amongst the public.

CO is a colourless, tasteless, odourless, non-irritating gas produced as a by-product during incomplete combustion of fuels due to there being insufficient oxygen present. Complete combustion occurs when sufficient oxygen is present and leads to the production of carbon dioxide.

Our interests and expertise are in the prevention of CO exposure, and we recently funded AirSafe London to undertake a small observational pilot study which looked at CO in cars, CO in cars: what are we breathing? A UK-based observational study of in-cabin vehicle CO levels. You can read more find out more about this study on our website:-

https://www.coresearchtrust.org/our-activities/co-inside-cars-what-are-we-breathing-a-uk-based-observational-study-of-in-cabin-vehicle-co-levels





Given our interests and expertise, we have restricted our comments to the relevant questions and are responding to Questions 1 – 3, 14, and 18: -

1. In your view, should the date of the first MOT

Move from 3 to 4 years

2. Please explain why you hold this view.

Moving the date of the first MOT to four years would reduce operating costs for drivers and may, be an appropriate adjustment given improved car safety design.

However, in order to safeguard public health, we believe that increases in the testing schedule regarding emissions would be appropriate. For the same reasons, we recommend testing on MOT for the presence of in-cabin leakage of exhaust gas, as outlined at question 3 below.

3. In your view, should changes be introduced alongside changing the date of the first MOT test to mitigate any effects on road safety (for example, re brake and tyre wear) or polluting emissions

- additional safety information campaigns for drivers
- additional odometer checks)?
- DfT publicity to ensure that motorists keep their vehicles safe ahead of the date of first MOT test?
- ensure vehicle service packages include items that are also covered in the MOT
- other (please specify)

Alongside the proposed widening of emissions testing on MOT for the purposes of public health, we also advocate adding measurement of in-cabin emissions. This could be trialled through regional pilot schemes prior to adoption of a routine test.





This recommendation follows recent UK-based research funded by the CO Research Trust which showed elevated exhaust levels within the interiors of a proportion of cars tested (1).

This data reproduces several larger studies, (including meta-analyses) conducted worldwide (2-9).

It is accepted that the inhalation of low-level exhaust fumes is damaging to health, with the effect of CO inhalation upon cardiovascular (10-12), neurological (13-16) and mitochondrial function (17,18) being well-documented. Furthermore, pregnant women (19,20), children (21) and the unborn (22, 23) are especially vulnerable to its effects.

In-cabin exhaust leaks may also contribute to the incidence of road traffic accidents: the threshold at which elevated carboxyhaemoglobin causes drowsiness has been placed as low as 3.4 per cent (24), which correlates to approximately 20ppm ambient CO (25).

From 2030, this issue is likely to become an increasing focus of publicised health inequality, as lower-income households find themselves driving an ageing cohort of petrol- and diesel-fuelled cars.

We believe that in-cabin air quality testing on MOT would be a low-cost, proportional and timely response to this issue. As a service-based public health intervention, in-cabin air quality testing would also fulfil Marmot Policy Objective 6: strengthening the role and impact of ill-health prevention (26), cited in the UK Government policy document, 'Health disparities and health inequalities: applying All Our Health" (27). This also concurs with the 2019 NHS Long Term Plan (28).

14. How does the MOT (or other roadworthiness testing) need to change to accommodate the differences between electric and hybrid vehicles and traditional internal combustion engine vehicles?

As noted at (3) above, the shift to electric vehicles from internal combustion engine vehicles is likely to be accompanied by disparity in ownership across income groups, with resulting health inequality. The MOT test will need to prioritise and address key features of this inequality. We would strongly suggest that in-cabin air quality is one such feature.





18. What changes do you think should be made to elements of the current MOT test for cars, motorbikes and vans? This could be elements that should be added to or removed from the current test or tested in other ways:

- alternative ways of testing the main failure items such as brakes and tyres
- other actions to ensure the emission control technology fitted to cars is operating correctly
- enhanced testing of noise emissions
- testing of window tinting
- change approach on advisory standards (tyres, brakes near safety critical levels)
- other (specify)

Please see our response at (3), above.

Thank you for the opportunity to respond to this consultation, if you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact me by email (adrian@coresearchtrust.org)

With kind regards

AdM'C\_d

Adrian McConnell

Chief Executive

CO Research Trust





## References

- Duggan S, CO in cars: what are we breathing? A UK-based observational study of incabin vehicle CO levels. CO Research Trust Winter Lecture Series, 28 April 2022, online presentation. Available from: <a href="https://www.coresearchtrust.org/our-activities/co-inside-cars-what-are-we-breathing-a-uk-based-observational-study-of-in-cabin-vehicle-co-levels">https://www.coresearchtrust.org/our-activities/co-inside-cars-what-are-we-breathing-a-uk-based-observational-study-of-in-cabin-vehicle-co-levels</a>, accessed 20.02.23
- 2. Kaur, S, Niewenhuijsen MJ, Colvile RN, Fine particulate matter and carbon monoxide exposure concentrations in urban street transport microenvironments. *Atmospheric Environment* (2007), Vol. 41 (23) 4781-4810, doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2007.02.002">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2007.02.002</a>
- 3. Kaur S, Nieuwenhuijsen MJ. Determinants of personal exposure to PM2.5, ultrafine particle counts, and CO in a transport microenvironment. *Environ Sci Technol.* (2009) Jul 1;43(13):4737-43. doi: 10.1021/es803199z.
- 4. Alameddine I, Abi Esber L, Bou Zeid E, et al. Operational and environmental determinants of in-vehicle CO and PM2.5 exposure, *Science of The Total Environment*, (2016) Volumes 551-552, pp42-50, doi: https://doi.org./10.1016/j.
- 5. Harik G, El-Fadel M, Shihadeh A, et al. Is in-cabin exposure to carbon monoxide and fine particulate matter amplified by the vehicle's self-pollution potential? Quantifying the rate of exhaust intrusion, *Transportation Research Part D: Transport and Environment* (2017), pp 225-238, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trd.2017.05.009">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trd.2017.05.009</a>.
- 6. Good N, Mölter A, Ackerson C, et al. The Fort Collins Commuter Study: Impact of route type and transport mode on personal exposure to multiple air pollutants. *J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol.* (2016) Jun;26(4):397-404. doi: 10.1038/jes.2015.68.



- 7. Audrey de Nazelle A, Bode O, Orjuela JP, Comparison of air pollution exposures in active vs. passive travel modes in European cities: A quantitative review, *Environment International* (2017), Volume 99, pp 151-160, doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2016.12.023">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2016.12.023</a>.
- 8. Kingham S, Longley I, Salmond J, Pattinson W, Shrestha K. Variations in exposure to traffic pollution while travelling by different modes in a low density, less congested city. *Environ Pollut.* (2013) Oct;181:211-8. doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2013.06.030.
- 9. Potchter O, Oz M, Brenner S et al. Exposure of motorcycle, car and bus commuters to carbon monoxide on a main road in the Tel Aviv metropolitan area, *Israel. Environ Monit Assess* (2014) 186: 8413. doi:10.1007/s10661-014-4013-
- 10. Misztal T, Rusak T, Tomasiak M. Peroxynitrite may affect clot retraction in human blood through the inhibition of platelet mitochondrial energy production. *Thrombosis Research* (2014) 133 (3) 403-411. doi: 10.1016/j.thomres.2013.12.016
- 11. Dallas ML, Yang Z, Boyle JP et al. Carbon monoxide induces cardiac arrhythmia via induction of the late Na+ current. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med.* (2012) Oct 1;186(7):648-56. doi: 10.1164/rccm.201204-0688OC
- 12. Meyer G, André L, Tanguy S, et al. Simulated urban carbon monoxide air pollution exacerbates rat heart ischemia-reperfusion injury. *Am J Physiol Heart Circ Physiol.* (2010) May;298(5):H1445-53. doi: 10.1152/ajpheart.01194.2009
- 13. Thom SR, Bhopale VM, Han ST, Clark JM, Hardy KR. Intravascular neutrophil activation due to carbon monoxide poisoning. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. (2006); 174:1239–48. doi: 10.1164/rccm.200604-557OC.
- 14. Thom SR, Bhopale VM, Fisher D, er al. Delayed neuropathology after carbon monoxide poisoning is immune-mediated. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*. (2004);101(37):13660-13665. doi: 10.1073/pnas.0405642101





- 15. Ning K, Zhou YY, Zhang N, et al. Neurocognitive sequelae after carbon monoxide poisoning and hyperbaric oxygen therapy. *Med Gas Res.* (2020);10(1):30-36. doi: 10.4103/2045-9912.279981
- 16. Pepe G, Castelli M, Nazerian P, Vanni S, Del Panta M, Gambassi F *et al*, Delayed neuropsychological sequelae after carbon monoxide poisoning: predictive risk factors in the Emergency Department. A retrospective study. *Scand J Trauma Resusc Emerg Med.* (2011) Mar 17;19:16. doi: 10.1186/1757-7241-19-16.
- 17. Alonso JR, Cardellach F, López S, Casademont J, Miró O. Carbon monoxide specifically inhibits cytochrome c oxidase of human mitochondrial respiratory chain. *Pharmacol Toxicol.* (2003) Sep;93(3):142-6. doi: 10.1034/j.1600-0773.2003.930306.x.
- 18. Queiroga CS, Almeida AS, Vieira HL. Carbon monoxide targeting mitochondria. *Biochem Res Int.* (2012); 2012:749845. doi: 10.1155/2012/749845.
- 19. Grippo A, Zhang J, Chu L et al. Air pollution exposure during pregnancy and spontaneous abortion and stillbirth. *Rev Environ Health* (2018) Sep 25;33(3):247-264. doi: 10.1515/reveh-2017-0033. PMID: 29975668; PMCID: PMC7183911.
- 20. Friedman P, Guo X, Stiller R et al. Carbon Monoxide Exposure During Pregnancy.

  \*\*Obstet Gynecol Surv\*\* (2015) Nov;70(11):705-12. doi: 10.1097/OGX.0000000000000238.

  \*\*PMID: 26584719.
- 21. Macnow T, Waltzman M. Carbon Monoxide Poisoning In Children: Diagnosis And Management In The Emergency Department. *Pediatr Emerg Med Pract.* (2016) Sep;13(9):1-24. Epub 2016 Sep 2. PMID: 27547917.
- 22. Levy R. Carbon monoxide pollution and neurodevelopment: A public health concern. *Neurotoxicol Teratol.* (2015) May-Jun;49:31-40. doi: 10.1016/j.ntt.2015.03.001.



- 23. Benagiano V, Lorusso L, Coluccia A et al. Glutamic acid decarboxylase and GABA immunoreactivities in the cerebellar cortex of adult rat after prenatal exposure to a low concentration of carbon monoxide. *Neuroscience*. (2005);135(3):897-905. doi: 10.1016/j.neuroscience.2005.06.058.
- 24. Wright G, Randell P, Shephard R, Carbon Monoxide and Driving Skills, *Archives of Environmental Health: An International Journal*, (1973) 27:6, 349-354, doi: 10.1080/00039896.1973.10666400
- 25. Fife C, Otto G, Koch S et al. *A Noninvasive Method For Rapid Diagnosis Of Carbon Monoxide Poisoning.* The Internet Journal of Emergency and Intensive Care Medicine (2000) Volume 5 Number 2. Available at: <a href="https://ispub.com/IJEICM/5/2/3479">https://ispub.com/IJEICM/5/2/3479</a>, accessed 20.02.23
- 26. Marmot, M. Fair society, healthy lives: the Marmot Review: strategic review of health inequalities in England post-2010. (2010) ISBN 9780956487001
- 27. Office for Health Improvement and Disparities. Health disparities and health inequalities applying All Our Health. Available from:

  <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/health-disparities-and-health-inequalities-applying-all-our-health">https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/health-disparities-and-health-inequalities-applying-all-our-health</a>, accessed 20.02.23
- 28. NHS. The NHS Long Term Plan (2019). Available from:

  <a href="https://www.longtermplan.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/nhs-long-term-plan-version-1.2.pdf">https://www.longtermplan.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/nhs-long-term-plan-version-1.2.pdf</a>, accessed on 20.02.23